ASSER International Sports Law Series

More information about this series at http://www.springer.com/series/8858

Frans de Weger

The Jurisprudence of the FIFA Dispute Resolution Chamber

Second Edition





Frans de Weger Legal Counsel Dutch Federation of Professional Football Clubs (FBO) Zeist The Netherlands

ISSN 1874-6926 ISSN 2215-003X (electronic)
ASSER International Sports Law Series
ISBN 978-94-6265-125-8 ISBN 978-94-6265-126-5 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-126-5

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016945136

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2008, 2016

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer imprint is published by Springer Nature The registered company is Springer-Verlag GmbH Berlin Heidelberg

Series Information

Books in the ASSER International Sports Law Series comprehensibly chart and analyse legal and policy developments in the emerging field of European and international sports law. Within scholarly publishing, the series is the most cited in its area and uniquely features contributions from the leading sports law scholars. It is a valuable resource for practitioners, academics, sports officials, and anyone interested in or impacted by sports and the law.

The Series is developed, edited and published by the ASSER International Sports Law Centre in The Hague. The Centre's mission is to provide a centre of excellence in particular by providing high-quality research, services and products to the sporting world at large (sports ministries, international—intergovernmental—organisations and federations, the professional sports industry, etc.) on both a national and an international basis. As a pioneer in the field of European and international sports law, the Centre has established a worldwide network of academics and practitioners and cooperation agreements with various sports law institutes and centres in Europe and beyond.

Apart from the Series, the Centre edits and publishes *The International Sports Law Journal*.

Editor-in-chief

Prof. Dr. Ben Van Rompuy e-mail: b.van.rompuy@law.leidenuniv.nl

Series editor

Dr. Antoine Duval e-mail: a.duval@asser.nl

Editorial Office

ASSER International Sports Law Centre T.M.C. Asser Instituut P.O. Box 30461 2500 GL The Hague The Netherlands www.sportslaw.nl



Advance Reviews

Frans de Weger's work on the jurisprudence of the DRC is a "must-have" for any-body dealing with sports law and, in particular, dealing with football issues under the *FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players*. It is a comprehensive and well-organized book that I highly recommend.

Massimo Coccia, Professor of International Law and Attorney-at-Law in Rome (Italy), CAS Arbitrator, Author of many publications on sports law issues

Where to go when trying to understand the FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players? Now Frans de Weger has the answer with his new version of the much-awaited and needed "Jurisprudence of the FIFA DRC". His first one of 2008 was and is still the only book in English which has reviewed the long and winding case law of FIFA DRC. This is not an easy task and the 2016 edition has not only improved on its predecessor but also opened a wider range of enlightenment for the football law practitioner. This is the book that we all called for and quoting Woody Allen, I would say that with it you will be aware of "Everything you wanted to know about FIFA DRC and you were afraid to ask". We must thank Frans for sparing us time with this clairvoyant and helpful book.

Juan de Dios Crespo Pérez Sports lawyer

By a systematic and analytical study of the most important decisions rendered by the FIFA Dispute Resolution Chamber, Frans de Weger has traced the context, purpose and evolution on how one should read and understand the *FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players*. The Author has managed to explain in a pure and understandable way the issues specific to the industry of football and how these should be taken into account by clubs and players in their legal relationship and within organised football. The second edition of this book, which is systematic and practical at the same time, will surely be of great interest to both specialists active in the world of "football law" and aspiring individuals.

Wouter Lambrecht, Attorney-at-law, Head of Legal at the European Club Association, FIFA Dispute Resolution Chamber Member and Mediator at the Court of Arbitration for Sport

Contents

Part I Introduction

1	Backg	ground Di	spute Resolution Chamber	3
	1.1	Introduc	tion	4
	1.2	Regulati	ons on the Status and Transfer of Players	6
		1.2.1	Introduction	6
		1.2.2	History	6
		1.2.3	Bosman Case	7
		1.2.4	Post-Bosman Period	8
		1.2.5	2001 Edition	10
		1.2.6	2005 Edition	11
		1.2.7	FIFA Comparison 2001 and 2005	13
		1.2.8	FIFA Commentary	14
		1.2.9	2008 Edition	16
		1.2.10	2009 Edition	17
		1.2.11	2010 Edition	18
		1.2.12	2012 Edition	19
		1.2.13	2014 Edition	20
		1.2.14	2015 Edition	21
		1.2.15	2016 Edition	24
	Refere	ences		24
2	Proce	dural Asp	vects	25
	2.1	_		26
	2.2			28
	2.3	Compos	ition	30
	2.4	Jurisdict	ion	31
		2.4.1	Civil Court	31
		2.4.2	The PSC	35
		2.4.3	The DRC	39
			2.4.3.1 General	39
			2.4.3.2 "Sub a Procedure": ITC Request	41

viii Contents

		2.4.3.3	"Sub b Pr	ocedure": Employment-Related	
			Disputes .		4
			2.4.3.3.1	General	4
			2.4.3.3.2	International Dimension	4
			2.4.3.3.3	Independent Arbitration	
				Tribunal	5
		2.4.3.4	Training (Compensation and Solidarity	
				m	5
		2.4.3.5		Mechanism Between Clubs	
			•	g to the Same Association	5
	2.4.4	The DRO		I the Single Judge	
			_		5
	2.4.5				5
2.5					6
	2.5.1				6
	2.5.2			RSTP	6
2.6					6
2.7					7
2.8					7
2.9			_		7
2.10					7
2.11					8
2.12					8
2.13					8
2.14					8
2.15					8
2.16					8
2.17					Ģ
2.17	2.17.1			eedings	ģ
	2.17.1			sation	ģ
2.18					9
2.19					ģ
2.19	_				9
2.20	2.20.1				9
	2.20.1				10
	2.20.2			tion	1(
	2.20.3				1(
	2.20.4				10
				ory Committee	1(
2.21	Count			ary Committee	1(
2.21			-		
	2.21.1				10
	2.21.2	_			10
D.C	2.21.3			Aspects	10
Ketere	nces				1

Contents ix

D 4	TT	T)		
Part	ш	Dec	:ISI	ons

3	Intro	duction to Classification of Decisions	113
4	4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4	Introduction Information About the Player Medical Result Conclusion	117 117 118 119 123
5	Visa a 5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4	And Work Permit. Introduction Visa. Work Permit Conclusion	125 125 126 128 130
6	Emple 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 6.5	oyment Contract Introduction Negotiations Invalid Conditions Precedent Essentialia Negotii Formal Aspects 6.5.1 Form 6.5.2 Length 6.5.3 Signature. 6.5.4 Language	131 132 136 139 141 143 143 145 146 150
	6.6 6.7 Refere	Payments 6.6.1 Salaries 6.6.2 Bonuses Conclusion	152 152 156 159 161
7	7.1 7.2 7.3	teral Extension Option. Introduction DRC Jurisprudence. 7.2.1 Decisions Between 2004 and 2006 7.2.2 Decisions Between 2007 and 2009 7.2.3 Decisions After 2010 CAS Jurisprudence.	163 164 165 165 168 173 177
	7.4 Refere	Conclusion	186 186 187 191
8	Termi 8.1 8.2 8.3	Ination Introduction Mutual Agreement Relegation Clause	193 194 195 200

x Contents

	8.4	Probatio	n Period.				203
	8.5	Period o	f Notice				205
	8.6	Just Cau	se				208
		8.6.1	For the C	Club			208
			8.6.1.1	Performan	nce Player		209
			8.6.1.2	Played M	atches		216
			8.6.1.3	Injury			219
			8.6.1.4	Absence			224
			8.6.1.5	Misbehav	iour		229
				8.6.1.5.1	General		229
				8.6.1.5.2	Drug Abuse	·	233
					8.6.1.5.2.1	DRC	
						Jurisprudence	233
					8.6.1.5.2.2	Mutu Cases	235
				8.6.1.5.3	Alcohol		238
				8.6.1.5.4	Conclusion		239
		8.6.2	For the F	Player			240
			8.6.2.1	Outstandi	ng Salary		240
			8.6.2.2	Exclusion	and Deregist	tration	254
	8.7	Sporting	Just Caus	e			260
		8.7.1	Introduc	tion			260
		8.7.2	Requirer	nents			261
			8.7.2.1	Establishe	ed Profession	al	262
			8.7.2.2	Appearan	ce Profession	al	263
			8.7.2.3	"15-Day	Гегт"		263
		8.7.3	CAS and	l DRC Juris	sprudence		263
		8.7.4	Final Re	marks	- 		266
	8.8	Conclus	ion				268
	Refere	nces					271
9	Comp	ancation					273
,	9.1						274
	9.2						276
	9.3					e Player	286
	9.3	9.3.1		•			286
		9.3.1					287
		9.3.2	9.3.2.1	-			287
			9.3.2.2			Compensation	288
			9.3.2.3			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	289
			9.3.2.4				293
	9.4	Compen				he Club	294
	J. ↑	9.4.1		-	-		294
		9.4.1					299
		9.4.2				cted Period	300
		₹. ₩	9.4.3.1				300
			7.4.3.1	muoducti	011		500

Contents xi

		9.4.3.2 V	Webster Case	302
		9.4.3.3 <i>I</i>	Matuzalem Case	304
		9.4.3.4	De Sanctis Case	305
	9.5	Conclusion		312
	Refere	ence		314
10	Sport	ing Sanctions		315
	10.1	Introduction		315
	10.2	Sporting Sanctions o	n Player	316
			h Rule	318
		10.2.2 Aggravatin	g Circumstances	321
	10.3	Sporting Sanctions of	n Club	323
		10.3.1 Inducemen	t	325
	10.4	Conclusion		330
	Refere	ence		330
11	Traini	ing Compensation		331
11	11.1	_		333
	11.2		Bosman	335
	11.2	*	ase	335
			aven Saga	337
	11.3		mpensation Due?	340
			ssional Contract	340
			t Transfer	342
	11.4	_	Amateurs and Professionals	344
		11.4.1 Introductio	n	344
			orudence	345
		11.4.3 CAS Jurisp	orudence	353
		11.4.4 Conclusion	1	358
	11.5	Responsibility of the	New Club	360
		11.5.1 General		360
		11.5.2 Player Pass	sport	363
			t of the National Association	364
	11.6			365
	11.7	_	mpensation <i>not</i> Due?	372
				372
			Exceptions Worldwide	372
			1.7.1.1.1 Circumvention	376
			1.7.1.1.2 Prescription	379
			1.7.1.1.3 Women's Football	382
			Exceptions Within the EU/EEA	382
			1.7.1.2.1 General	382
			1.7.1.2.2 Free Movement of Players	384
		1	1.7.1.2.3 General Rule: Contract	
			Offer to Professionals	205
			and Amateurs	387

xii Contents

			11.7.1.2.4	Prerequisites		
					4	392
				11.7.1.2.4.1	"60-Day	
					Obligation"	
					and "Equivalent	
					Value"	392
				11.7.1.2.4.2	Registered	
					Mail	393
			11.7.1.2.5	Justification		399
				11.7.1.2.5.1	General	399
				11.7.1.2.5.2	DRC	
					Jurisprudence	400
				11.7.1.2.5.2.1		
					Between	
					2004 and	
					2010	400
				11.7.1.2.5.2.2		
				11.7.11.2.3.2.2	After 2010	403
				11.7.1.2.5.3	CAS	103
				11.7.1.2.3.3	Jurisprudence	406
	11.8	Waiver of	Rights		•	410
	11.0	11.8.1	General			410
		11.8.2	Decisions Between 2			411
			Decisions After 2010			416
		11.8.4	Conclusion			422
	11.9		on of the Amount			423
	11.7	11.9.1	General			423
		11.9.2	Worldwide			425
		11.9.2	Within EU/EEA			427
	11.10		on of the Training			428
	11.10	11.10.1	General			428
			DRC Jurisprudence.			428
			CAS Jurisprudence.			432
			Conclusion			435
	11.11		risproportionate Rule			437
	11.11					443
						446
	Refere	nces				440
12	Solida	rity Mecha	anism			447
	12.1	Introducti	on			448
	12.2	Domestic	Transfers			450
	12.3	Responsib	oility of the New Club			452
		12.3.1	Calculation			452
		12.3.2	Distribution			454
			12.3.2.1 General			454

Contents xiii

		12.3.2.2 Decisions	455
		12.3.2.3 Conclusion	464
		12.3.3 Player Passport	465
	12.4	Entitlement of the National Association	466
	12.5	Prescription	470
	12.6	Contingent Payments	471
	12.7	Loan	472
	12.8	Exchange of Players	473
	12.9	Buy-Out Clause	477
	12.10	Default Interest	480
	12.11	Conclusion	481
	Refere	nce	482
13	Final (Conclusions	483
Ind	ev		401

Abbreviations

BGH German Bundesgerichtshof CAS Court of Arbitration for Sport

CAS Code of Sports-related Arbitration

CHF Swiss Franc

CJEU Court of Justice of the European Union

CO Swiss Code of Obligations
DRC Judge Single Judge of the DRC
DRC or Chamber Dispute Resolution Chamber
EC European Commission

EU European Union

EURO EUR

FA Football Association

FBO Dutch Federation of Professional Football Clubs FIFA Fédération Internationale de Football Association

FIFA Commentary Commentary on the Regulations of the Status and Transfer

of Players

FIFA Comparison Comparison of the FIFA regulations version July 2001 and

following Circulars with the new FIFA regulations version

December 2004

GBP British Pounds

ICAS International Council of Arbitration for Sport IRTC International Registration Transfer Certificate

ITC International Transfer Certificate
KNVB Royal Netherlands Football Association

NDRC National Dispute Resolution Chamber

NDRC Regulations National Dispute Resolution Chamber Standard Regulations

PILA Private International Law Act

Procedural Rules Rules governing the Procedures of the Players' Status

Committee and the Dispute Resolution Chamber

PSC Players' Status Committee

RSTP Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players

xvi Abbreviations

SCCSwiss Civil CodeSFTSwiss Federal TribunalSingle JudgeSingle Judge of the PSC

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

TMS Transfer Matching System TPO Third-Party Ownership

UEFA Union Européenne de Football Association

Foreword

Its competence and the applicable regulations having been established, the members of the Dispute Resolution Chamber went on to deal with the substance of the matter and started by acknowledging the facts of the case and the arguments of the parties as well as the documents contained in the file.

These or very similar words are contained in hundreds of decisions of the FIFA judiciary bodies. What follows, in all those decisions, is the dealing with thousands of personal stories, raised claims, advanced objections, submitted allegations and, yes, also legal arguments made by the parties before FIFA.

Since their creation, the FIFA judiciary bodies and in particular the FIFA Players' Status Committee (PSC) and the FIFA Dispute Resolution Chamber (DRC), together with their Single Judges, have rendered several thousand decisions. And even though "nobody is perfect" and no adjudicatory body of this world can claim never to take a wrong decision, the work of the FIFA judiciary bodies has helped solving a huge number of disputes in quite an efficient manner, providing the parties with a judiciary, objective assistance that may still be considered to be sometimes too slow, but which is also rather inexpensive and pretty much well-fitted for an international environment like the one of international football.

It is praiseworthy that FIFA publishes a large number of decisions of the PSC and the DRC on its website on a regular basis. However, the handling and the analysis of such decisions is not easy. If one looks for instance at the more than 2000 decisions of the DRC currently available online, one will see that they are first very numerous and second divided in simply four categories: labor-related disputes, training compensation, solidarity matters and disputes relating to overdue payables.

Back in the years 529 to 534 p. Chr., the Eastern Roman Emperor Justinian ordered the collection of all sources of Roman jurisprudence, and so the admirable Corpus Iuris Civilis was put together, a fundamental work providing an overview on the quite chaotic Roman legal system existing at that time.

xviii Foreword

Today, almost identically, the present book, prepared under the wise guidance of my dear friend Frans de Weger, provides the reader—or even: the "user"—with a great access to the body of the jurisprudence of the FIFA DRC: DRC decisions are selected and commented, and a clear structure of topics is established, by attributing the DRC decisions to several classes of disputes.

The reading and the consultation of this excellent book, including the good introductory chapters, can only be strongly recommended to lawyers involved in football-related matters. Both the more unexperienced law student and the well-versed attorney will be able to draw very useful information from a rich pool of interesting materials.

The author and the editors of this book can only be thanked by all those who love football—those who have the chance to work on football-related matters.

Zurich August 2016 Michele Bernasconi Attorney-at-law in Zurich, Switzerland Arbitrator at CAS and President of the Swiss Sports Law Association

Author's Note

In the first edition of this book reference is made to the relevant decisions issued by the FIFA Dispute Resolution Chamber ("the DRC") from the date of its existence in 2001 until 2006. Now, in 2016, in this second edition, reference is made to the relevant decisions from 2001 until 2016. More than 15 years' worth of DRC decisions.

During the years the jurisprudence of the DRC has become increasingly "well-established". The decisions by the DRC are more and more extensive and Single Judges are getting more involved (to reduce the workload). Further, we also note a positive development with regard to the length of the DRC procedures, sharpening deadlines and limiting the exchange of correspondence in procedures, also considering that FIFA introduced the so-called fast track procedure of Article 12bis of the FIFA Regulations on the Status and Transfer of Players ("the RSTP"). Step by step, a swifter dispute resolution process has finally been created by FIFA.

However, it shouldn't be left unmentioned that the length of the procedures before the DRC can still be shortened. In comparison to the procedures before the Court of Arbitration for Sport ("the CAS"), the DRC could also be stricter with regard to deadlines in procedures. Considering the well-established DRC jurisprudence that has been created over the years since 2001, the DRC must also remain open to new developments in international football law and cannot be immune under all circumstances from the impact and influence of European law, leading CAS jurisprudence and Swiss law. The existence and creation of "well-established jurisprudence" bears the risk of becoming less accessible for 'outside' developments.

Although by no means exhaustive, this book aims to provide an overview of the "well-established jurisprudence" of the DRC. However, as always, the devil is in the details. One must be aware that relying on an individual decision by the DRC can be quite risky since it happens that the DRC (especially in the past) deviated from its standard line but in later decisions reverts to its former "well-established jurisprudence". Nowadays and as said before, the jurisprudence has become increasingly "well-established" and these kinds of divergent decisions are more and more exceptional. Furthermore, I make exact references and stay

xx Author's Note

close to the relevant considerations made in the decisions by the DRC to gain a broad(er) and more precise knowledge of the general view of the committee. Due to the increasing internationalization of the professional football world, the DRC decisions become more and more important within the international field of professional football, which will also have its impact, directly or indirectly, at national level (certainly in the long run), such as for national arbitration tribunals. By making exact references to the general considerations of the DRC in its decisions over the years, the flipside of the coin is that it is not a 'nice romantic novel' to read. It must therefore be considered as a work of reference.

Let me stress that the FIFA jurisprudence is of utmost importance. First of all, taking into consideration that the CAS is the appeal committee which makes these awards at least as interesting, FIFA, however, sometimes maintains its own line even if the CAS has a different point of view. In this regard, it must be mentioned that less than 5 % of the DRC decisions is annulled by the CAS which means that most of the DRC decisions can therefore be seen as final and binding. Moreover, not all parties have the financial means to appeal to the CAS or the (low) amount at stake does not make it worthwhile (taking into account the relatively high arbitration costs before the CAS) to appeal against the DRC decision before the CAS (on the understanding that also a dispute with a low amount at stake does not necessarily mean that it is not an interesting case from a legal point of view). In other words, in many DRC cases, the DRC is the last resort. Therefore, for legal advisors to operate quickly and adequately in the dynamic world of international professional football, secure and up-to-date knowledge of the DRC jurisprudence and its continuing and rapid developments, is obviously indispensable. It must finally be noted that the DRC jurisprudence is quite consistent (more consistent than the jurisprudence of the CAS in relation to certain subjects) and with its well-established jurisprudence, contributes to more legal uniformity, equality and certainty.

This edition is more practical due to my experience and activities over the last few years as a senior legal counsel at the Dutch Federation of Professional Football Clubs ("FBO") in procedures before the DRC, as well as (previously before I was appointed as a CAS Arbitrator) the CAS, the appeal committee of the DRC. This second edition addresses many issues on the understanding that experience teaches that there are many legal pitfalls with regard to several subjects which the DRC has to deal with. This edition has a scientific as well as a practical character and is useful for both the practitioner and the scientist. It goes without saying that this book is especially a useful and practical tool for those actually acting in legal procedures before the DRC, such as international football lawyers and clubs' legal counsels.

Having said that, this edition is not only provided with references to decisions by the DRC, but also, if necessary, to relevant decisions by the FIFA Players' Status Committee ("the PSC"), which are also published since 2011 on FIFA's website, in order to better understand certain considerations of the DRC. Furthermore, in order to place the DRC decisions in the right legal perspective, reference is also made to leading awards issued by the CAS. However, since the essence of this book is "the DRC", many references to the CAS and the PSC

Author's Note xxi

cases are especially made in the footnotes in order to maintain focus on the DRC decisions. The reference to the CAS jurisprudence in the footnotes, which is by no means exhaustive, is mainly meant to better find one's way in the CAS jurisprudence and so to ease finding the relevant CAS jurisprudence. Also, attention will be brought to relevant *unpublished* decisions issued by the DRC, the PSC and CAS awards. As a side-note, it must be mentioned that during the writing of this second edition, it came to my knowledge that FIFA apparently decided, for unknown reasons, to remove certain earlier published decisions from the current list of decisions on its (new) website (which means that certain DRC decisions cannot be found on FIFA's current website anymore). Having decided to make reference to these removed decisions in this second edition anyway, in order to show all relevant legal thoughts of the Chamber, however, I felt forced to share this knowledge in this Author's Note.

In my point of view, this edition is improved and is more 'mature' in comparison to the first edition. But it is also far more extensive. And not forgetting, it is obviously up-to-date. Please forgive me if I am not exhaustive with regard to all the subjects and with regard to the DRC (and especially the CAS) jurisprudence. I tried to be as complete as possible (which is also difficult due to the existence of many—not less important—unpublished decisions). As the reader will notice for several subjects, a short conclusion has been included for ease of reference, where reference is made in a nutshell to the well-established DRC jurisprudence. In a manner of speaking, merely reading this part would be enough to gain general knowledge of the vision of the DRC. I sincerely hope you find this second edition worth reading and that it helps us all with our cases in the future.

2016 Frans de Weger